

PRCC Hatchery Subcommittee Meeting

Thursday, June 19, 2014

Via Teleconference

Meeting Summary

Meeting Attendees

PRCC HSC Members

Casey Baldwin, CCT
Bill Gale, USFWS
Lynn Hatcher, NMFS
Keely Murdoch, YN
Peter Graf, GPUD
Mike Tonseth, WDFW

Other Participants

Elizabeth McManus, Ross Strategic (facilitator)
Andy Chinn, Ross Strategic (facilitator)

Decisions

1. HSC members voted to approve objectives 1 through 9 of the draft Priest Rapids Hatchery 2014-2015 implementation plan, with the exception of objective 5 (stray rate), pending resolution of the question of additional otolith sampling (see notes below for discussion).

Actions

2. NMFS will check with Mike Ford to see if the draft genetics manuscript can be distributed.
3. NMFS will contact USFWS staff to notify them of an impending consultation for bull trout related to the composite broodstock effects analysis.
4. YN will circulate a clean version of the draft composite broodstock collection SOA and will discuss internally whether to call for an e-mail vote on the draft SOA.
5. NMFS will circulate the letter confirming 1347 coverage to GPUD following review.
6. CCT will circulate its proposal for expanded otolith sampling in the draft Priest Rapids Hatchery 2014-2015 implementation plan.
7. GPUD will clarify the status of the 2013 Wenatchee M&E Plan Report with CPUD.
8. GPUD will submit the draft 2015 Wenatchee M&E implementation plan prior to the July HSC meeting.
9. GPUD will circulate the draft 2015 White River temporary acclimation plan prior to the July HSC meeting for review and discussion (status: carried over from May meeting).
10. WDFW will draft a letter summarizing its concerns around the draft SOA on composite broodstock collection and circulate it with the HSC (status: carried over from May meeting).
11. WDFW will continue to work with NMFS to resolve the permit coverage situation for GPUD fall Chinook produced at Priest Rapids Hatchery and released from Ringold (status: carried over from May meeting).
12. CCT will circulate its Chief Joseph hatchery program workshop report with the HSC (status: carried over from April meeting summary).

13. GPUD will look into options for HSC document storage and access (status: in progress).

Meeting Summary

I. Composite Broodstock Collection

A. Internal NOAA Discussions on Effects Analysis – NOAA circulated a summary of internal discussions to date on the effects analysis from composite broodstock collection. NOAA believes that compositing is a practical approach, and genetic approaches used to date have not proven practical. For the effects analysis, NOAA will consider long term and short term risks and benefits to listed fish. NOAA is considering a schedule to notify other affected parties of the timeline and permitting implications for the effects analysis, including consultation with USFWS on bull trout. NOAA's goal is to complete this work by the end of 2014 in order to inform 2015 broodstock collection protocol.

- USFWS noted that if NOAA's position is that Nason Creek and Chiwawa spring Chinook cannot currently be differentiated because they are genetically similar, the benefit of operating the Chiwawa weir becomes questionable. Operating the Chiwawa weir would not produce a different result than collecting only at Tumwater Dam. Increasing the number of broodstock collection sites will increase the number of bull trout spawning aggregates affected.
- NMFS commented that operation of the Chiwawa weir could still potentially provide some fish with historic Chiwawa genetic traits. The draft manuscript from Andrew Murdoch and Mike Ford would probably help explain questions such as this.
- USFWS noted that consultation requires a three month time frame (at minimum) and recommended NMFS begin discussions as soon as possible. USFWS has been uncomfortable with previous consultations, as NMFS has issued biological opinions prior to completing the consultation process.
- WDFW is currently in Section 7 consultation with USFWS and anticipates receiving a biological opinion soon.

B. Path Forward and Next Steps

- NMFS will check with Mike Ford to see if the draft genetics manuscript can be distributed.
- NMFS will contact USFWS staff to notify them of an impending consultation for bull trout related to the composite broodstock effects analysis.

II. Composite Broodstock Collection

A. Draft Composite Broodstock Collection SOA – The most recent version of the draft composite broodstock collection SOA was circulated on 6/10. There were no additional changes to the document since then.

- YN noted that it does not support the current SOA as written and reiterated that the intent of the SOA is to provide a simple means by which broodstock could be collected annually while meeting recovery needs.

- WDFW emphasized the importance of excluding White River and Little Wenatchee fish to the greatest extent possible, if a composite collection is used at Tumwater Dam. WDFW is interested in maintaining as much genetic diversity as possible in addition to meeting population abundance goals. WDFW suggested that fish collection at Tumwater should still include a genetic approach, with the baselines re-evaluated to include the most recent SNPs panels. Additionally, if the parameters under which composite broodstock collection can occur will be included in the biological opinion and Section 10 permit, it is unclear why an SOA is necessary.
- GPUD noted that clarity is important and if HSC members feel that Nason Creek and Chiwawa fish should be targeted using a genetic approach, the SOA should clearly state this.

B. Path Forward and Next Steps

- YN will circulate a clean version of the draft composite broodstock collection SOA and will discuss internally whether to call for an e-mail vote on the draft SOA.

III. Fall Chinook Permit Coverage

A. Coverage for ACOE Activities at Priest Rapids – WDFW reported that broodstock collection, holding, and (likely) spawning are covered by existing permits. GPUD is comfortable with NMFS issuing a letter recognizing that adult holding, spawning, and eyed egg incubation does not mean that GPUD is assigned liability for fish on-station. NMFS has drafted a letter noting that 1347 coverage includes take and use of excess for other hatcheries; the letter will specify that once the eggs or fish leave the facility, they are no longer GPUD’s responsibility. The draft letter will likely be circulated during the week of 6/23.

B. Path Forward and Next Steps

- NMFS will circulate the letter confirming 1347 coverage to GPUD following review.

IV. Priest Rapid Hatchery

A. 2014-2015 Implementation Plan – CCT circulated an e-mail outlining concerns with the draft implementation plan on 6/18:

“CCT has concerns related to Priest Rapids Hatchery (PRH) strays to UCR populations and to the Chief Joseph Hatchery Program (broodstock collection of known natural origin late arriving summer/fall Chinook). 2013 was a large run escapement for Columbia River fall Chinook and 2014 is predicted to be even larger. While operating the Chief Joseph Hatchery (CJH) ladder for the first time in 2013, CCT staff observed a high abundance of adipose present Chinook in and around the ladder during October and November. In 2013 the fall Chinook count at Wells Dam (+17,000) was considerably higher than the normal of 3-4,000. The Wells Dam counts have no way to distinguish PRH strays from Upper Columbia natural origin fish because the PRH fish do not all have an external mark. Also, WDFW sampling at the Eastbank Hatchery outfall in 2013, reported at large

percentage of the fish sampled as PRH origin. If PRH adipose present hatchery-origin Chinook are present in large numbers in the Okanogan River and/or in the vicinity of the CJH ladder, collection of known natural origin late-run broodstock for the CJH integrated program could be compromised. Additionally, contribution on the spawning grounds of PRD hatchery-origin Chinook could negatively affect stock genetics for the Okanogan summer/fall population.”

CCT proposes an expanded otolith analysis where otolith samples would be collected from late arriving broodstock in the Okanogan River (after the breakdown of thermal barriers). This would be combined with sampling of fish collected in the CJH ladder. The analysis would be an expansion of WDFW’s current contract to look at PRH otoliths.

- GPUD noted that strays are typically monitored through CWT recovery and expansion by tag rate.
- WDFW commented that the current CWT is a double index (600,000 adipose clipped and 600,000 non adipose clipped) and is only intended to look at contribution to fisheries, not as a tool with which to evaluate other programs. There is not much fishery for fall Chinook once they pass the dam, and CCT believes there is a higher rate of hatchery fish at the ladder than in the fishery.
- WDFW requested additional time to comment on stray rate M&E.
- GPUD requested more specific information on CCT’s proposed expansion of otolith sampling.

B. Voting

- HSC members voted to approve objectives 1 through 9 of the draft Priest Rapids Hatchery 2014-2015 implementation plan, with the exception of objective 5 (stray rate), pending resolution of the question of additional otolith sampling.

C. Path Forward and Next Steps

- CCT and WDFW will circulate their comments and/or a proposal for expanded otolith sampling in the draft Priest Rapids Hatchery 2014-2015 implementation plan.

V. Wenatchee M&E Plan Report

A. Approval Status – GPUD noted some confusion about the report’s status; GPUD’s understanding is that no comments were received during the review period, which ended in May, and the report is now final. The main issue is that GPUD’s contractors (primarily Bioanalysts) believe the report is final.

- WDFW noted that the report was not issued for committee review until 6/2 and is still under 30 day review. The last draft of the report did not have a necessary Methow spring Chinook component.
- YN concurred that it was under the impression that the document was issued for review on 6/2.

B. Path Forward and Next Steps

- GPUD will clarify the status of the Wenatchee M&E Plan Report with CPUD.

VI. Draft 2014 M&E Implementation Plan

- A. Status of Draft Plan** – During the 6/18 HCP-HC meeting, CPUD requested a due-date extension for the 2014 M&E implementation plan in order to make changes in the interest of adaptive management. GPUD requests the same consideration.
- YN commented that one of CPUD’s rationales for a revised deadline was that their streamlined contracting procedures allow for more rapid execution. Because the HSC has less experience working with GPUD on M&E issues, YN suggested that earlier GPUD delivery of the draft M&E implementation plan would be better.
 - GPUD recognized YN’s concerns and noted that, overall, GPUD would prefer to be able to make adaptive changes to the M&E implementation plan depending on what is occurring during the field season. However, in the interest of alleviating concerns, GPUD is comfortable with the July HSC meeting deadline for the draft plan.
- B. Path Forward and Next Steps**
- GPUD will submit the draft 2014 Wenatchee M&E implementation plan prior to the July HSC meeting.

VII. Wanapum Dam

- A. Update on Ladder Improvements** – GPUD installed a spiral chute on the left bank during the week of 6/9. The left bank fish ladder was shut down for 36 hours during installation, during which time GPUD also installed an approach ramp, a perforated plate to prevent adherence of Pacific Lamprey, and a jump curtain to prevent fish from jumping outside of the ladder. The right bank received the same renovations during the week of 6/16. GPUD’s goal is an interim pool raise by fourth quarter 2014. Spring Chinook numbers are beginning to slow, and summer Chinook and sockeye are beginning to appear. Injury rate observations at the Priest Rapids and Rock Island video count stations and Leavenworth NFH appear to be within normal ranges, according to a recent Fish Passage Center memo.

VIII. Wrap Up and Next Steps

- A. Next Meeting:** Thursday, July 19, 2014
- B. Potential July Meeting Agenda Items**
- PRH M&E 2014-2015 Implementation Plan
 - Nason Creek broodstock collection
 - Status of NMFS discussions on compositing
 - 2015 WR Acclimation Plan
 - 2014 Wenatchee M&E implementation plan
 - Wanapum Dam update

Meeting Materials

The following documents were provided to HSC members in advance of this meeting:
Priest Rapids Hatchery

- Draft Nason Creek SOA
- 2013 Annual Hatchery Report ([link](#))
- May 2014 Summary of NOAA Fisheries Internal Discussion on Spring Chinook Broodstock Compositing in the Wenatchee Basin
- Nason Creek May Rotary Trap Summary
- White River May Rotary Trap Summary
- PRH May M&E Summary
- Final June Meeting Agenda
- 2013 Nason Creek juvenile abundance report
- 2013 White River juvenile abundance report